***INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY* (IAAR)**

***External Expert Commission* (EEC)**

***For IAAR perusal***

***Accreditation Council***

******

**REPORT**

**on the results of the work of the external expert evaluation commission**

**for compliance with the requirements of program accreditation standards**

**and in regards to *the educational program***

**== 750100 ARCHITECTURE (MASTER'S DEGREE) ==**

**of the**

**KYRGYZ STATE TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY (KSTU)**

**named after I. RAZZAKOV**

***Date of the IAAR visit from" 10 "to" 12 " May 2023***

**Bishkek " 12 " May 2023**

Content

[(I) LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS 4](#__RefHeading___Toc139459910)

[(II) INTRODUCTION 6](#__RefHeading___Toc139459911)

[(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION 8](#__RefHeading___Toc139459912)

*[Brief history of EP develepment](#__RefHeading___Toc139459913)* [8](#__RefHeading___Toc139459913)

[(IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE 11](#__RefHeading___Toc139459914)

[(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC SESSION 12](#__RefHeading___Toc139459915)

[(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAM ACCREDITATION STANDARDS 13](#__RefHeading___Toc139459916)

*[6.1. Standard "Management of the main educational program"](#__RefHeading___Toc139459917)* [13](#__RefHeading___Toc139459917)

*[6.2. Information Management and Reporting Standard](#__RefHeading___Toc139459918)* [17](#__RefHeading___Toc139459918)

*[6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the main educational program"](#__RefHeading___Toc139459920)* [21](#__RefHeading___Toc139459920)

*[6.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the main educational program"](#__RefHeading___Toc139459921)* [24](#__RefHeading___Toc139459921)

*[6.5. Standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance" 26](#__RefHeading___Toc139459922)* [26](#__RefHeading___Toc139459922)

*[6.6. Standard "Students"](#__RefHeading___Toc139459923)* [29](#__RefHeading___Toc139459923)

*[6.7. Standard "Teaching staff"](#__RefHeading___Toc139459925)* [34](#__RefHeading___Toc139459925)

*[6.8. Standard "Educational resources and student support systems"](#__RefHeading___Toc139459926)* [38](#__RefHeading___Toc139459926)

*[6.9. Public Awareness Standard](#__RefHeading___Toc139459927)* [41](#__RefHeading___Toc139459927)

[(VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/ BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD 43](#__RefHeading___Toc139459928)

[(VIII) OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY 44](#__RefHeading___Toc139459929)

[(IX) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION 45](#__RefHeading___Toc139459930)

[(X) RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD 45](#__RefHeading___Toc139459931)

[Appendix 1. Evaluation table "PROGRAM PROFILE PARAMETERS" 46](#__RefHeading___Toc139459932)

# LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AC Academic Council

ARF Academic research staff and faculty

DE-QM Department of Education and Quality Management

DLC Distance Learning Center

ECTS European system for transferring and accumulating points

EEC External Expert Commission, IAAR

EMC Educational and Methodical Council

EMSp Educational and methodological complex for specialization

EP Educational Program

EScM KR Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic

ESS Educational support staff

Faculty I Professors and other faculty

Faculty II Instructors and lecturers

FCU Financial Commission of the University

GEP General Education Program

HEI Higher educational institution

IAAR Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating

IAD Institute of Architecture and Design

IEI International Educational Institution

ISP Independent student project

MEP Major educational program

NEL RF National Electronic Library of the Russian Federation

NTP Nationwide testing program

PMS Regulation on educational management IT system

QMS Quality Management System

RP Research project

RSCI Russian Science Citation Index

SAC State Attestation Commission

SRP Student research project

VSE Vocational secondary education in the Kyrgyz Republic

FCW Final qualification work

# Introduction

In accordance with the order of the Director General of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency No. 40-23-OД dated 16.03.2023, this external expert commission evaluated from May 10 to May 19, 2023 the educational program 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) Institutions at the Kyrgyz State Technical University named after I. Razzakov (hereinafter – Razzakov KSTU) for compliance with accreditation standards of the main educational program of higher professional education (Kyrgyz Republic, approved and put into effect by Order No. 1-22 of the General Director of the Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency of January 05, 2022- OД).

The report of the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) contains the results of the evaluation of the university's activities in the framework of quality assurance of the EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) according to the criteria of accreditation standards, recommendations of the ECC for further improvement of the educational program, the conclusion of the ECC (Appendix 1. Program profile Parameters), the program of the EEC visit (Appendix 2), the results of a survey of teachers, etc. students (Appendices 3-4).

**The structure of the EEC IAAR:**

*EEC Chairman* **-** Viktor A. Kamkin, PhD, Associate Professor of Toraigyrov University, IAAR Category I expert (Pavlodar, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*EEC Coordinator* **-** Guliyash Balkenovna Niyazova, Project Manager for institutional and specialized accreditation of IAAR universities (Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan).

*IAAR Category I Expert* - Marina V. Pogrebitskaya, PhD, Associate Professor, M. Kozybayev North Kazakhstan University, member of the IAAR Expert Commission on Higher Education (Petropavlovsk, Republic of Kazakhstan). Assessment of EP 510200 Applied Mathematics and Computer Science (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category I Expert* – Ruslanbek Nurmamatovich Arapbayev, Ph. D., Associate Professor, Vice-Rector for Research of Osh State University (Osh, Kyrgyz Republic). Assessment of EP 510200 Applied Mathematics and Computer Science (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category I Expert, student* - Egizbayeva Asylzat Yerkinkyzy, 2nd year student of the educational program Information Systems of the Korkyt Ata Kyzylorda University (Kyzylorda, Republic of the Republic). Quality assessment of EP 510200 Applied Mathematics and Computer Science (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category II Expert* - Inna Sidorova, MBA, Master of Science in Economics, Business Manager, BGC Partners, (London, United Kingdom). Quality assessment of EP 580100 Economics (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category III Expert, student* - Karybek Aigerim, 2nd year student of the educational program 580100 Economics (Master's degree) M. Ryskulbekov Kyrgyz University of Economics (Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic). Quality assessment of EP 580100 Economics (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category II Expert* - Alexander Vorontsov, Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor, Dean of the Faculty of Innovative Technologies of Mechanical Engineering of the Yanka Kupala State University of Grodno (Grodno, Republic of Belarus). EP 670200 Operation of transport and technological machines and complexes (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category I Expert* - Kuanyshbek Shunkeev, Doctor of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Professor of K. Zhubanov Aktobe Regional University, member of the Expert Council on Higher Education (Aktobe, Republic of Kazakhstan). EP 670200 Operation of transport and technological machines and complexes (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category II Expert - Koshetaev student* Dias Sansyzbayuly, 1st year student of the educational program 7M11301 Logistics (by industry) of the Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan). EP 670200 Operation of transport and technological machines and complexes (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category I Expert -* Murat Amanzholovich Rakhimov, Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Building Materials and Technologies of Karaganda Technical University (Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan). Quality assessment of EP 50500 Construction (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category I Expert* - Tairov Mitalip Muratovich, Doctor of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Professor of Batken State University, member of the Expert Council on Higher Education (Kyzyl-Kyya, Kyrgyz Republic). Quality assessment of EP 50500 Construction (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category I Expert* - Gulshat Bukharbayevna Murzalina, Candidate of Technical Sciences, Associate Professor of the International Transport and Humanitarian University (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan). Quality assessment of EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category I Expert, employer* -Yuri Pilipenko, President of the Association of manufacturers of goods and services "Expobest" (Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan). Quality assessment of EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree).

*IAAR Category III Expert, student* - Batyr Nurzhanovich Papyshev, student of the educational program 6B07305 Construction of D. Serikbayev East Kazakhstan Technical University (Ust-Kamenogorsk, Republic of Kazakhstan). EP quality assessment 50500 Construction (Master's degree), 750100 Architecture (Master's degree).

# REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

The Kyrgyz State Technical University named after I. Razzakov (hereinafter - Razzakov KSTU) was initially established as Frunze Polytechnic Institute per Decision No. 9309-r, 24.08.1954, of the Council of Ministers of the USSR, the Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Kyrgyz SSR of 4.09.1954, as well as the Resolution of the Council of Ministers of the Kyrgyz SSR of 11.09.1954.

On 5.02.1991 by Resolution of the Supreme Council of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan No. 374 - XII , the Frunze Polytechnic Institute was renamed to Bishkek Polytechnic Institute.

By the Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 146 of 4.05.1992, the Kyrgyz Technical University and the Kyrgyz Institute of Architecture & Civil Engineering were established on the basis of the Bishkek Polytechnic Institute, which was later transformed by the Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic No. 11 of 6.01.1998 into the Kyrgyz State University of Construction, Transport and Architecture.

By the Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic "On measures to increase the potential and competitiveness of educational organizations of higher professional education of the Kyrgyz Republic" dated 18.06.2022 No. 243, the Razzakov KSTU was reorganized by establishing the status of legal successor and joining the Kyrgyz State University of Construction, Transport and Architecture (UCTA) named after N. Isanov, the Kyrgyz State University of Geology Institute of Mining and Natural Resources Development (UG IM NRD) named after U. Asanaliyev.

The Isanov UCTA took the first place in the ranking of Higher Education institutions of Kyrgyzstan in terms of areas and levels of specialist training - 2018, among the universities participating in the IAAR rating for training specialists in the areas of "Architecture" and "Construction" in the institutional rating and received a certificate from IAAR. https://bilim.akipress.org/unews/un\_post:11244

*Brief history развития of EP development*

The Department of Architecture was established in 1967 as the first special department that trains future architects of Kyrgyzstan within the Frunze Polytechnic Institute on the initiative of the famous architect Pavel Petrovich Ivanov. In those years architects, artists and art historians worked in the department. Currently, the department is headed by Academician of the International Academy of Architecture of the Eastern Countries, Doctor of Architecture, Professor D. D. Omuraliev.

The first graduation of specialist architects took place in 1970. In 2012 the architect training program was offered at the bachelor's degree program. In 2014, the master's degree program was introduced for "Design of architectural and urban planning objects" and "Formation of an architectural and urban planning environment" subjects. The first 3 Masters in Architecture Degrees were awarded in 2018. The dynamics of Master’s graduation is shown in **Table** 1.

**Table** 1-Dynamics of graduate students of EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree)

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **№****n /** | **Academic year** | **Number of graduates** | **Percentage of job placement** | **Place of work** |
| 1 | 2017-2018 | 3 | 100 | KSTU, AALAM LLC,Alamudun district Administration |
| 2 | 2018-2019 | 8 | 75 | KSTU,State Institution "Bishkek Glavarkhitektura",Construction Company Office Techstroy, IT - technology Company |
| 3 | 2019-2020 | 9 | 100 | KSTU,State Institution"Bishkek Glavarkhitektura" |
| 4 | 2020-2021 | 4 | 75 | KSTU, Asian Innovation College, Millennium Construction Company |
| 5 | 2021-2022 | 12 | 92 | KSTU,State Institution"Bishkek Glavarkhitektura", IC "Emark Stroy", IC Turan Stroy |

The License for the implementation of the Master's degree program was successfully obtained in 2013 from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic.

The personnel potential of the department has a positive trend. To date, the qualified staff availability for the EP is 92%.

The faculty enjoy a diverse base of practice bases and student placement opportunities (see Table 1). To guide the practice of Master degree students, experts with extensive experience in project and research work are involved.

The main research program at the department -- "Trends in the development of architecture, urban planning and design, in light of current professional education in Kyrgyzstan" has been active for many years and consists of the following sections:

1. Evolution of architectural and urban planning concepts in Kyrgyzstan;
2. Architecture and urban development in Central Asia;
3. Historical, theoretical and methodological foundations of the ethnic (traditional) architecture in Kyrgyzstan;
4. Theoretical content and design methodology problems of recent architecture;
5. Modern challenges in the development of architectural education.

Since 2018 the department researchers have published articles in the following number: 4 at Scopus, 1 at Web of Science, 1 at Hirsch, 20 at RSCI and more than 10 articles in the Bulletins of scientific works of USTA, KSTU, KRSU (Kyrgyz Russian Slavic University). The Department of Architecture published 23 articles and 6 reports by the faculty and students in 2021-2022; while in 2020-2021 there were 31 articles published. Over the past 5 years several monographs, 2 textbooks, and 7 teaching aids have been published. Since 2018 the Master’s degree students of the department have published more than 40 research papers on selected topics related to their master's thesis.

The Master’s Program graduates of the Department of Architecture currently work as instructors or senior instructors (Maanaeva N., Barpybekov T, Isakov Y, Aliev S., Kenenbekov B, Berdibekov A, Sadyrbekov M., Rysbekov B). They actively participate in research projects at the Department and prepare to continue their studies under the PhD program.

To organize the scientific and educational process, the department has available design and research rooms, computer labs and lecture rooms (**Table** 2)[.](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/materialno-tekhnicheskaja_baza_kafedry1.pdf)

**Table** 2-Material and technical support.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **R&D Labs****(Room #s)** | **Room areas** | **Total Room Area, m2** |
| **The Department of Architecture - 5th floor** |
| 8/501  | Design center | of 48.6 m2 |
| 8/501 b  | Project office for Master’s students | 14.2 m2  |
| 8/502  | Computer lab for Master’s students | computer class for undergraduates  |
| 8/503, 504, 504а  | Lecture rooms  | 53,6 m2 33,7 m2 18,2 m2 |
| 8/505 | Conference halls for scientific and practice sessions  | of 51.8 m2 |
| 8/505A | Academic Support (AS) Office  | of 10 m2 |
| 8/511  | Office of the Department Head Office for AS | 36 m241,9 m2  |
| 8/ 501 and  | Office of the Faculty | 28 m2 |
| 1/103  | Workshop and Research Lab | 18 m2 |
| 1/104  | Workshop and Research Lab | 18 m2 |
| total |  | 424,4 m2 |
| **Department of Architecture - 7th floor** |
| 1-701 | Lecture Room | 36 m2 |
| 1-702  | Computer Lab | of 36 m2 |
| 1-703  | Practice Room | 36 m2 |
| 1-704  | Practice Room  | 36 m2 |
| 1-716  | Workshop for senior students | of 40 m2 |
| 1/714  | Department of Architecture | 36 m2 |
| 1/714  | Office of the Faculty | 18 m2 |
| 1/103  | Scientific Research Room | 18 m2 |
| 1/104  | Scientific Research Room | 18 m2 |
| Branches of the Department (Asmat, LLC)  | R&D Practice | 100m2 |
| Branch of the Department(Bishkek Glavarkhitektura) | R&D Practice | 120m2 |
| Branch (Ak-Bashat Design Institute) | R&D Practice | 100m2 |
| Total |  | 594 m22 |

The Institute of Architecture and Design provides educational services to students of all levels in the field of Architecture[,](https://kstu.kg/instituty/institut-arkhitektury-i-dizaina) while academic support to Master’s students at level 7 of the NRC is provided under by the School of Magistracy.

# DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

External expert evaluation of EP 750100 in Architecture for Master's degree at KSTU by the standards of program accreditation within the main educational program for higher professional education (in the Kyrgyz Republic, approved and put into effect by the order of the General Director of the NU "Independent Accreditation and Rating Agency" dated January 05, 2022, No. 1-22-OД) has been held for the first time.

# DESCRIPTION OF THE EEC SESSION

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the approved Program of the visit of the IAAR External Expert Commission to KSTU (program and primary program accreditation of educational programs) in the period from May 10 to May 12, 2023.

In order to coordinate the work of the EEC an on-line orientation meeting was held on 08.05.2023 where responsibilities were distributed among the commission members, the schedule of the visit was confirmed, and agreement was reached on the choice of methods for evaluating EP.

To obtain reliable information on the quality of the EP and the entire infrastructure of the university and clarify the content of self-assessment reports, meetings were held in a hybrid format on 10.05.2023 with the management of KSTU: the Rector of the University, with vice-rectors per areas of activity, heads of organizational divisions, directors of Institutes, heads of departments, and faculty. On 11.05.2023, meetings were held with students, graduates and employers. Tasks were also carried out with regards to the documents of the Department "Architecture" and attendance of faculty per schedule of the 1st-year Master’s program students EP 750100 “Architecture” (Lecturer Halmurzayeva G. B.). We witnessed the state of the teaching material and equipment availability at the Institute of Architecture and Design, classrooms, workshops for seminars and practices were observed along the accreditation profile of the educational institution; places of academic support for educational, scientific, and social process have been visited, as well as the practice base at LLC "Archstudio "ASMAT". The EEC assessment continues on 12.05.2023 with discussion of parameters, development, recommendations, and decision-making by voting. A total of 40 representatives participated in the meetings (**Table** 3).

**Table 3** - Employees and trainees participation in meetings with IAAR EEC

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Category of participants** | **Number** |
| **Rector** | **1** |
| **Vice-rectors** | **7** |
| **Heads of departments**  | **13** |
| **Directors of institutes** | **2** |
| **Heads of educational institutions** | **1** |
| **Instructors** | **4** |
| **Undergraduates**  | **4** |
| **Graduates** | **4** |
| **Employers and representatives of the student practice bases** | **4** |
| **Total** | **40** |

At the meeting of the IAAR EEC with the Institute's target groups, the mechanisms for implementing the university's policy were clarified and certain data presented in the university's self-assessment report were specified.

The practice databases were reviewed, and questions to the heads of organizations LLC "ASMAT", LLC "Concept PLAN" were also asked.

In accordance with the accreditation procedure, an online survey was conducted with 4 instructors and 7 students.

To confirm the information provided in the Self-assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the university's working documentation. Along with this, the experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university ([kstu.kg](https://kstu.kg/)).

Within the framework of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational programs of KSTU, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 12.05.2023.

# COMPLIANCE WITH PROGRAM ACCREDITATION STANDARDS

*6.1. Standard for "Management of the main educational program"* (MEP)

* *An educational organization should have a published quality assurance policy that reflects the relationship between research, teaching, and learning.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate the functioning of an internal quality assurance system that contributes to the implementation of the MEP's quality assurance policy.*
* *The educational organization should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes in quality assurance of the MEP, the differentiation of the functions of collegiate bodies.*
* *Management should provide evidence of the transparency of the MEP management mechanism, including risk planning and identification, and resource allocation.*
* *The educational organization should demonstrate the functioning of mechanisms for forming and regularly reviewing the MEP development plan and monitoring its implementation.*
* *The educational organzation should ensure transparency in organizational development plan by involving representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, trainees, and teaching staff.*
* *Management should demonstrate the individuality of the MEP development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and the development strategy of the EO.*
* *Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including the implementation of joint / two-degree education and academic mobility.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate innovation management within the framework of the MEP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals.*
* *Management must demonstrate their competence in managing the quality of MEP and confirm that they have completed advanced training courses in educational management programs.*
* *MEP management should strive to ensure that progress is made since the last external quality assessment procedure was taken into account when preparing for the next procedure.*

***Evidence***

 KSTU has adopted the  [Policy and Strategy for quality assurance in education,](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/abiturientu/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-2) approved by the KSTU Academic Council (Protocol No. 10 of 26 May 26, 2021). The quality policy is reflected in the [Development Strategy of](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/programma_strategii_razvitija_kgtu.pdf)  KSTU until 2030 and adopted at the meeting of the Academic Council, Protocol No. 10 of May 26, 2021[. The Educational Quality Management System](https://kstu.kg/otdel/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/polozhenie-otvestvennosti-po-kachestvu) is guided by the [Council for Quality](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/prikaz_o_sostave_soveta_po_kachestvu_2021.pdf) and local regulatory documents.

[The KSTU Council for Quality](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/prikaz_o_sostave_soveta_po_kachestvu_2021.pdf) coordinates the quality policy implementation, University's quality departments responsible for improvement of the quality in educational process. The activities of the Council for Quality are carried out in accordance with [Regulations on Council for Quality](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_o_sovete_po_kachestvu.pdf), KSTU.

To support the main business processes at the university, a set of internal regulatory documentation has been developed that regulates the implementation of the MEP and differentiates the functions of collegiate bodies, which includes: [Quality policy and](https://kstu.kg/otdel/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/lo) [strategy, Regulations on structural divisions](https://kstu.kg/otdel/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/lo) (in Educational Management, HR Management, Career Center, Institutes, etc.); regulations on collegiate bodies ([the Board of Trustees,](https://kstu.kg/universitet/5-kolonka/popechitelskii-sovet) [the Finance Committee,](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_o_finansovom_komitete_kgtu_im.i.razzakova.pdf) [the Anti-corruption Commission](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_ob_antikorupcionnoi_komissii_kgtu_im.i.razzakova.pdf)); Internal regulatory documents [(Regulations on](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_ob_organizacii_uchebnogo_processa_v_kgtu_i.i.razzakova_na_osnove_kreditnoi_sistey_ob._ects_2022.pdf) [the organization of the educational process using credits methodology, etc.).](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_ob_organizacii_uchebnogo_processa_v_kgtu_i.i.razzakova_na_osnove_kreditnoi_sistey_ob._ects_2022.pdf) The main part of business processes is documented. All external and regulatory documents are posted on the university's website and are available to all users of the corporate network.

To determine, review and adjust the goals of the EP, the Architecture Department holds meetings, round tables with the participation of teaching staff and stakeholders ([the resolution of the round table on the topic: "Interaction of the university with employers – as a condition for high-quality training of graduates for architects of the Kyrgyz Republic"),](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/rezoljucija_kruglogo_stola_1.pdf) and also takes into account national and international experience and recommendations for organizing mobility of students and teachers. Student participation is ensured by involving student representatives in the development of planned learning outcomes within individual disciplines, practices, monitoring student satisfaction with the quality of education, and providing information for independent assessment of the quality of education at KSTU. There [is a questionnaire for undergraduates at the Department Architecture.](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/anketirovanie.pdf)

The main stakeholder, which is the state, participates in the development of the content of the educational program through the State Higher Professional Education Institution "Architecture", through the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic in terms of regulatory legislation. The State Agency for Architecture, Construction and Housing and Communal Services under the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Union of Architects of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Bishkek Department of Architecture, Architectural Firms, Research Institutes and other stakeholders from the business sector of the economy participate in the development of the QMS, working curricula, practical training and certification programs. Once a year, following the results of the dissertation defense, stakeholders from design firms, the Union of Architects take part in an extended meeting of the department, where they share their proposals regarding the optimization and structuring of the educational program.

KSTU has established [Institute of Joint Educational Programs](https://kstu.kg/instituty/institut-sovmestnykh-obrazovatelnykh-programm) (IJEP / ISOP), authorized to develop, implement and administer joint educational programs. It was established by order of the Rector No. 1/02 following the Memorandum for Higher Education between Russian Federation (RF) and Kyrgyz Republic (KR) under protocol "On the establishment of the Russian-Kyrgyz Consortium of Technical Universities" between the RF Ministry of Education & Science and the KR Ministry of Education & Science upon approval by the KSTU Academic Council dated 31.10.2012. The institute was established on the premises of MEI KSTU and the Department for Project Implementation of BSTU-KSTU on January 2, 2013.

The IJEP / ISOP’s main goal is to provide students with high-quality education, facilitating the opportunity to study at several universities under joint programs. Joint educational programs are currently active among [the Association of Asian Universities,](https://aauniv.org/) [universities of the Shanghai организацией](http://uni-sco.ru/) [Cooperation Organization,](http://uni-sco.ru/) and universities [of the Russian-Kyrgyz Consortium of technical](https://studyabroad.mpei.ru/rus/RKKTU/Pages/default.aspx) [universities.](https://studyabroad.mpei.ru/rus/RKKTU/Pages/default.aspx)

***Analysis***

EEC IAAR held meetings, conversations and interviews with vice-rectors, heads of departments, heads of structural divisions, students, teaching staff, representatives of employers ' organizations and graduates, as well as conducted a survey of teaching staff and students, detailed familiarization of experts with the university's educational infrastructure, material and technical, information and methodological resources, and the necessary knowledge and skills of the University. The document notes the following:

The description of the standard defines the purpose, objectives, development plan of the educational program, monitoring system, and their implementation. It contains information about the participation of representatives of interested parties (employers, teaching staff, students) in the collegiate management bodies of the educational program, as well as their representativeness in making decisions on the management of the educational program. The university has published quality assurance policy, and the functions of those responsible for the processes within the EP are defined. Improvement of the EP development plan is aimed at implementing the strategy and policy, achieving the set goals and high-quality implementation of the EP. The report reflects the transparency of the processes of forming the development plan of the EP and ensuring awareness of stakeholders about the content of the development plan of the EP and the processes of its formation.

An important component of effective implementation of the EP and coordination of its actions in general with the work of the university is:

- centralized planning (with the right to independently determine the department's development indicators that reflect the specifics of the implemented educational programs and the resource potential of the department (teaching staff, technologies used, corporate communications and their content (participation in the educational process, scientific activities, employment promotion, organization of internships, internships, etc.);

- a single monitoring and reporting system for all divisions;

- survey of teaching staff, students and employees of the university for satisfaction with the conditions of organizing the educational process and work (including an assessment of the work of educational process support services and university infrastructure); survey of employers on the quality of training specialists.

At the same time, the information provided during the EEC visit did not allow us to fully determine the commitment to quality assurance of any activities performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including in the implementation of two-degree education and academic mobility.

***Strengths/Best practices:***

The author demonstrates the individuality and uniqueness of the educational development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization.

***WEC recommendations:***

1. The EP management should consider the possibility of implementing a two-degree education within the framework of an accredited EP.

2. Develop a roadmap for academic mobility of students. The deadline is 2023-2024 academic year.

***Conclusions of the Higher School of Economics on the criteria of the standard "Educational program Management":***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) of 11 parameters: 1 has a strong position, 9 satisfactory and 1 parameter that suggests improvements.***

*6.2. Information Management and Reporting Standard*

* *The educational organization should demonstrate the functioning of the mechanism for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software tools.*
* *MEP management should demonstrate the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system.*
* *Management should show the functioning of the reporting mechanism, which includes an assessment of the effectiveness of the MEP, the activities of structural divisions in the framework of quality assurance.*
* *The educational organization should determine the frequency, forms and methods of evaluating the management of the educational organization, the activities of collegiate bodies and structural divisions, and the implementation of scientific projects.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate the implementation of a mechanism for ensuring information protection, including identifying those responsible for the accuracy and timeliness of information provision.*
* *The educational organization should show the involvement of students, employees and teaching staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them.*
* *MEP management should demonstrate the existence of mechanisms for communication with students, employees, and other stakeholders, including conflict resolution.*
* *The PA should measure the degree of satisfaction with the quality assurance needs of teaching staff, trainees, and staff, and demonstrate evidence for addressing the identified deficiencies.*
* *Information collected and analyzed by the university within the framework of the MEP should take into account:*

*key performance indicators;*

*dynamics of the number of students in the context of forms and types of training;*

*the level of academic performance, student achievements, and deductions.*

*students ' satisfaction with the quality of MEP implementation, training in the educational organization;*

*availability of educational resources and support systems for students;*

*employment and career development of graduates.*

* *Management should ensure that a mechanism is in place to inform stakeholders of any planned or undertaken actions within the framework of the MEP.*
* *The MEP guidelines should help to provide the necessary information in the relevant fields of science.*

***Proof***

The department conducts systematization and updating of the student body annually according to the movement of students, this parameter is dynamic (**Table** 4).

**Table** 4-Dynamics of the number of undergraduates

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2018 | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 |
| Numberof applicants | 18 | 19 | 18 | 23 | 18 | - |
| Numberof defenses | 3 | 8 | 9 | 4 | 12 | 13 |

All data about students and all operational information is available in the information system [< avn.kstu.kg >,](https://avn.kstu.kg/) are duplicated in AVN and KelBil mobile apps, which are available in both [Google Play](https://play.google.com/) and the [App Store.](https://apps.apple.com/ru/app/kelbil/id1436225857)

In order to inform all stakeholders, KSTU effectively works on:

- Educational portal: [avn.kstu.kg](https://avn.kstu.kg/)

- Official website: [kstu.kg](https://kstu.kg/)

- Distance Learning Center: [сdeksucta.kg](https://www.cdeksucta.kg/)

 - Mobile applications: [" AVN LMS ".](https://avn.kstu.kg/)

Optimization is implemented through setting and achieving quality objectives, data analysis, internal audit results, survey and questionnaire results, risk assessment, and management review.

The Department of Architecture conducts an annual survey of students ["Satisfaction of teaching staff with the activities of KSTU",](https://kstu.kg/otdely/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija) which allows you to identify the results of the department's activities and the results of the educational program. In addition, individual appeals of students and teaching staff are considered promptly, the head of the department is analyzed, decisions are made within his competence. "Results of the survey" Student satisfaction with the quality of the organization of the educational process " is presented on the website.

The mechanism for reviewing the implemented tasks and learning outcomes of the EP is reduced to processing and systematizing information periodically received from employers, due to changes in labor market demands, from offers of graduates of the EP working in the near and far abroad, students studying on an individual educational trajectory, state and educational organizations of the Kyrgyz Republic by making appropriate changes to the State Higher Professional Education work programs (QMS).

Assessment of management and achievement of the goals of Educational programs is carried out by the Department of Architecture based on the results of employers ' feedback on the quality of professional activities of graduates. Employers ' feedback on the professional activities of graduates in the form of achieving their goals and learning outcomes is heard at meetings of the department, meetings of the Academic Council of the IAD. Documentation confirming the periodic assessment of the level of management of educational programs is reflected in the minutes of meetings of graduates of the Department "Architecture" and meetings of the Academic Council of IAD. Each member of the faculty of the Department of Architecture has a clear understanding of the methods of managing the EP, as well as the learning outcomes that graduates of Educational programs have.

Representatives of various architectural and construction companies, design organizations, the Union of architects, professional communities, and relevant ministries take part in the development of the EP cluster Bishkekglavarkhitektura. By assessing the degree of satisfaction with the quality of educational services, students ' needs for qualitative updating and changing the content of the cluster's curriculum are taken into account.

Faculty members of the Architecture Department have the opportunity to participate and make suggestions for improving their activities at general meetings, meetings with the rector, vice-rectors, directors of institutes, at meetings of the department, Councils of Institutes, the Rector's Office, and the Academic Council. Specific examples of participation and suggestions for improving activities are noted in the minutes of meetings of the department (Extract from Protocol No. 9 of 08.02.2022, extract from Protocol No. 10 of 03.02.2023). Conflicts of interest and relations between the employer and the teaching staff, teaching staff and students are resolved through a system of procedures at the following managerial levels: head of the department; Director of the Institute of IAD; Vice-rector; Rector; Anti-corruption Commission and Ethics Commission. Mechanisms for identifying conflicts (Regulation on the Anti-corruption Commission of KSTU dated 05.10.2022, Pr No. 1, Regulation on the Commission on Labor Discipline and Ethics of KSTU dated 05.10.2022,Pr No. 1) are applications of teaching staff, employees and students, official and report notes, personal appeal to the head.

The results [of the "Analysis of student performance"](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/uspevaemost_studentov_magistratury_2021-2022g.pdf) of the accredited EP cluster in the context of profiles for the last academic year show that 31% of graduate students in the field of "Architecture" have fully passed exams in all disciplines. The main reasons for the average academic performance of graduate students are weak attendance due to their employment, i.e. the vast majority of students at the master's level combine their studies with work, and not timely payment of tuition fees. During the summer period, students with academic debts pay off their loans and re-pass the relevant disciplines, and by the beginning of the next academic year, almost 90 % of students with academic debts will accomplish their unfinished tasks.

In the educational process for the cluster of educational program "Architecture", a sufficient number of classrooms are used, equipped with modern information and demonstration facilities and computer equipment, as well as design workshops.

The University has access to the [www.kyrlibnet.kg](http://www.kyrlibnet.kg) Electronic Library [Association](http://kyrlibnet.kg/ru/) of Kyrgyzstan.

В Currently, the Scientific and Technical Library of KSTU has implemented the program "[Library Automation System IRBIS 64",](http://www.elnit.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=35&Itemid=108) which automates the work of the library and collects materials for the open archive. Electronic catalogs in the IRBIS 64 program contain 307,851 electronic books, 33,000 bibliographic entries are included in the electronic catalog, which makes it easier to search for the necessary literature. Electronic catalogs are constantly updated together with university faculty. The number of educational literature related to teaching subjects related to EP – 6403, which is about 3 % of the total number of e-books.

The university has a contract with the global company Autodesk and uses free student versions of the company's products on a long-term basis: AutoCAD, AutoCAD LT, Autodesk Revit, Autodesk Robot Structural Analysis, AutoCAD Civil 3D, Autodesk BIM 360. The products mentioned above are used for the design, visualization, calculation and structural analysis of buildings, structures and infrastructure facilities based on the BIM-technology concept.

Since 2023, the Department of Architecture has been negotiating with a Spanish architectural firm to use Bimserver.center services. On 17.04.23 and 18.04.23, a training seminar will be held on the topic: Bim - server software for students and undergraduates in the field of Architecture.The seminar is conducted by invited representatives of the company Suret from Spain.

***Analytical part***

Analyzing the EP on the content and semantics of the standard "Information Management and reporting" in accredited areas, the commission notes that the university has a system for managing information and reporting on student recruitment, academic performance, contingent movement, personnel, academic mobility of teaching staff and students, etc., which is presented in regular reports at the meeting of departments, the Rector's Office and the Academic Council of the University. Regular surveys of students and employers are conducted and appropriate measures are taken to eliminate shortcomings based on the results of their survey / interviewing. Eliminating them by effectively managing resources and time through their optimization and reduction of excessive papermaking, introducing electronic document management, reducing excessive public workload, improving, simplifying, optimizing the work of various processes (especially educational ones), further informatization of all processes through computerization, increasing the speed of the Internet.

The EP management acknowledges the lack of and has not demonstrated the determination of the procedure and provision of information protection, including the identification of responsible persons for the accuracy and timeliness of information analysis and data provision.

***Strengths/Best practices:***

There are no strengths identified in this standard.

***EEC recommendations:***

Starting from the 2024-2025 academic year, the CC management should implement a mechanism for ensuring information protection, including identifying those responsible for the accuracy and timeliness of information provision.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria of the standard "Information Management and Reporting":***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) of 16 parameters: no strong positions, 15 satisfactory and 1 parameter suggesting improvements.***

*6.3. Standard "Development and approval of the main educational program"*

* *The EO should demonstrate that there is a documented procedure for developing, approving, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating the performance of the PA at the institutional level.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate the collegiality of the development and quality assurance of the MEP (participation of students, teaching staff, and other stakeholders).*
* *Management should demonstrate that external reviews of the MEP are conducted.*
* *Management must demonstrate that the content of the MEP meets the established goals and expected learning outcomes:*

*- development of MEP based on a student-centered approach in teaching and learning, State Budget of the Kyrgyz Republic certainty of the program structure based on the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTAS);*

*- development of the content of the MEP, taking into account the volume of theoretical training, research, and professional practice;*

*- correspondence of the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes to each other and to the corresponding level of study (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies) determined by the NSC, QF-EHEA;*

*- the validity of the influence of disciplines and their focus on ensuring that each student learns the expected results;*

*- development of procedures for evaluating students' academic achievements, including final certification.*

* *An important factor is the ability to prepare students for professional certification.*
* *Management should demonstrate that the MEP graduate model is available.*
* *The management should demonstrate the uniqueness of the MEP, its positioning in the educational market (regional / national / international).*
* *An important factor is the presence of a two-degree and / or joint EP with foreign universities and demonstration of their practical implementation.*

***Proof***

The cluster of an educational program in the field of "Architecture" has goals and expected learning outcomes that are formulated in the MEP. There is a Regulation on the procedure for developing and approving [the main educational program Architecture on the website.](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/oop__pago_2020_pdf__14.04.2021.pdf) All regulatory documents of educational programs are available [on the KSTU website.](https://kstu.kg/bokovoe-menju/instituty/institut-arkhitektury-i-dizaina/arkhitektura/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-1)

In general, learning objectives and outcomes have well-defined relationships with academic disciplines and expected professional competencies that graduates should discover based on the expected achievement of RO. [Goals and objectives are published on the site. и](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/celi_i_ro__magistr..pdf)  [опубликованы на сайте.](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/celi_i_ro__magistr..pdf) All [local regulatory documents of KSTU are](https://kstu.kg/otdel/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/lo) available [.](https://kstu.kg/otdel/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/lo)

The purpose of the educational program of the cluster "Architecture" corresponds [to the mission](https://kstu.kg/universitet/2-kolonka/missija-universiteta/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju) [and strategic goals](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/programma_strategii_razvitija_kgtu.pdf) of KSTU.

Monitoring of the implementation and evaluation of the effectiveness of the MEP is carried out on the basis [of the MEP audit.](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/abiturientu/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-6)

Mechanisms for updating and adjusting the cluster of the Architecture educational programin accordance with the requests of all groups of stakeholders are regulated [by regulatory documents regarding quality assurance of the educational process and](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/abiturientu/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-2) [on the University's website.](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/abiturientu/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-2)

The Department of Architecture submitted the following materials for the examination of the educational program: state educational standard in the direction of "Architecture", working curricula of the educational program; educational programs with detailed goals and Learning Outcomes; CMO for each discipline; list of assigned disciplines, questionnaire of disciplines; staff schedule of teaching staff, portfolio and questionnaire of each teaching staff; information about the material and technical base of the department; minutes and extracts from meetings minutes and extracts from extended meetings of the department with invited stakeholders; questionnaires and surveys of all interested parties.

The special features of the schedules implemented at the departments include the following:

1. A schedule that is largely unified in terms of the implemented EP is used.

2. According to educational programs implemented under the State Higher Professional Education System of the Kyrgyz Republic, the annual duration of theoretical training for 1-2 courses is 30 weeks. At the same time, the academic year is divided into 2 semesters of 15 weeks, and in the middle of each semester, current progress monitoring is carried out. In the final master's degree course, the academic year is divided into two semesters: the first semester – theoretical training (lasting 15 weeks), the second (15 weeks) - performing qualification work.

4. Each semester ends with an intermediate assessment (examination session).

5. The spring semester, as a rule, ends with practical training: in the master's program-scientific and industrial, pedagogical and research practice.

6. Holidays are not less than 6 weeks in the school year.

Programs of academic disciplines are developed in accordance with the content of the State Higher Professional Education System of the Kyrgyz Republic, take into account the recommendations of the UME, sample programs for disciplines of different publication periods, traditional features of the scientific and methodological school of the university, regional aspects of training students of the 7th level of the NRC.

For educational programs implemented in accordance with the State Higher Professional Education System of the Kyrgyz Republic, programs in disciplines were developed in accordance with the approved KSTU curricula and drawn up in accordance with the form defined by the KSTU UME, corrected in 2015, 2018, 2020, 2021, reviewed and approved by decisions of the educational and methodological councils of institutes and the university.

Research and production, teaching, and research internships are held according to the end-to-end program of practical training (the end-to-end program of practical training is published on the website).

***Analytical part***

On a positive note, all interested parties participate in the preparation, approval, modification and addition of the EP, and they can recommend elective courses for inclusion in the catalog of elective subjects.

For the implementation of the educational program, work is carried out at a fairly high level on the preparation of educational and methodological documentation (UMCS, UMCD, syllabuses, etc.), which is discussed and passes an examination of their quality at different levels: the issuing department, the methodological council of the faculty, the university's UMS, internal audits, and approved by the Vice-rector for Academic Affairs.

The logical conclusion of training in educational programs is the final certification. It is noted that the list of topics for graduation papers is reviewed annually in connection with the emergence of new priorities in the development of science and education, the improvement of technologies, new teaching methods, and the development of basic research in science. When implementing educational programs, the necessary integrity is ensured, combining the required ratio between the theoretical and practical components of the educational process. It is necessary to emphasize that the content of modules, all types of practice and final work are aimed at achieving the goals of the EP and acquiring students ' professional and general cultural competencies.

***Strengths/Best practices:***

1. Demonstrated the collegiality of the development and quality assurance of the EP with the participation of students, teaching staff and employers;

***VEC recommendations***

Missing

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria of the standard "Development and approval of basic educational programs":***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) out of 13 parameters: 1 have strong positions, 12 are satisfactory and there is no parameter suggesting improvements.***

*6.4. Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the main educational program"*

* *Management should demonstrate that there is a documented monitoring and periodic evaluation process in place to achieve the MEP objective and continually improve its content.*
* *Management should demonstrate the effectiveness of monitoring and periodic evaluation of the MEP.*
* *OOP monitoring and periodic evaluation should address:*
* *content of the program in the context of the latest achievements in science and technology in a particular discipline;*

*changes in the needs of society and the professional environment;*

*students ' workload, academic performance, and graduation;*

*effectiveness of procedures for evaluating students ' academic achievements;*

*the needs and degree of satisfaction of students;*

*compliance of the educational environment and support services with the goals of the MEP.*

* *The management should ensure that the structure and content of the MEP are reviewed, taking into account changes in the labor market, the requirements of employers and the social demand of society, and the degree of satisfaction of students.*
* *Management should provide evidence of the involvement of students, employers, and other stakeholders in the revision of the MEP.*
* *The educational organization must ensure that all stakeholders are informed of any planned or undertaken actions, including the publication of changes made to the Public organization.*

***Proof part***

Periodic assessment of learning outcomes and achievement of the goals of Educational Programs by graduates for the period from 2018 and its continuous monitoring is carried out by the department, which implements the relevant EP based on the results of employers ' feedback on the quality of their professional activities, as well as an audit by the Department of Quality of Education. Reviews of employers about the professional activities of graduates in the form of achieving their goals and learning Outcomes of Educational programs are heard at meetings of the department ((Extract from Protocol No. 9 of 08.02.2022, extract from Protocol No. 10 of 03.02.2023, extract from Protocol No. 11 of 21.03.2023), meetings of the IAD Academic Council. There are reviews from the director of LLC "ASMAT" M. B. Abdyldaev, Director of LLC "ConceptPLAN" K. A. Kaepkulov.A round table resolution was adopted on the topic: "Interaction of the university with employers – as a condition for high-quality training of graduates for architects of the Kyrgyz Republic". Documentation confirming the periodic assessment of the level of achievement of the goals of educational programs is reflected in the minutes of the meeting of the Department of Architecture and meetings of the Academic Council of IAD.

The analysis of employment of graduates of the Educational Program and employer reviews show that the goals of Educational programs are being achieved.

In accordance with [the State Higher Professional Education Standard 750100 "Architecture"](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/gos_vpo_750100_arkhitektura__magistr_2.pdf), the maximum amount учебной нагрузки of a student's academic load is set at 45 hours (1.5 credits) per week, including all types of classroom and extracurricular (independent) academic work. In accordance with this standard , a [working учебный curriculum,](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/rup_magistr_no8-_2021_g..pdf) [academic](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/akademicheskii_kalendar_2022-23_uch.god_magistr_ochnaja_forma_obuchenija.pdf) [calendar](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/akademicheskii_kalendar_2022-23_uch.god_magistr_ochnaja_forma_obuchenija.pdf) and расписание class schedule are drawn up.

Monitoring and periodic assessment of the expectations, needs and satisfaction of students is carried [out by the Department of Quality of Education](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/abiturientu/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-5) and [the Department of Architecture on the basis of a questionnaire.](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/analiz_rezultatov__anketirovanija..pdf)

At the Department of Architecture, Academic Consultants interact with students to solve emerging academic problems. It is the advisor / supervisors who are interested in providing academic advice to students, as they are responsible for the latter's achievement of learning outcomes, for creating conditions for professional development of students in the educational process of the university.

Potential consumers of educational programs of the EP "Architecture" cluster are students and their parents, employers (representatives of architectural and urban planning organizations, directors of design firms), the state as the main stakeholder, teaching staff of the university/institute/department, and various educational organizations.

***Analytical part***

Information about changes in the EP is provided at meetings of departments, educational and methodological councils, and the Academic Council of the university. Also, interested parties are informed about upcoming meetings on the review of educational programs by means of communication (mobile communication/e-mail/WhatsApp). Departments have social media accounts (Instagram, Facebook), through which they inform all interested persons about events held at the departments and at the university.

*However, the EEC Commission notes* that there is no mechanism for informing all interested parties on the university's website about any planned or taken actions in relation to accredited EOS. The University *does not publish* information about changes made to the EP.

***Strengths/Best practices:***

There are no strengths identified in this standard.

***WEC recommendations:***

Starting from the 2024-2025 academic year, the EP management should provide publications in various media about any planned or undertaken actions related to the implementation of the EP. Based on the results of reviewing and making changes to the EP, ensure that the results of the changes made are published on the university's website.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria of the standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of basic educational programs":***

 ***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) of 11 parameters: no strong positions, 10 satisfactory and 1 parameter suggesting improvements.***

*6.5. Standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"*

* *MEP management should ensure respect and attention to different groups of students and their needs, and provide them with flexible learning paths.*
* *The management should ensure that teaching is based on modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of training, the use of various modern teaching methods and evaluation of learning outcomes that ensure the achievement of the goals of the MEP.*
* *The management should determine the mechanisms for distributing students ' academic load between theory and practice, ensuring that each graduate learns the content and achieves the goals of OOP.*
* *An important factor is the availability of our own research in the field of teaching methods of OOP disciplines.*
* *The educational organization must ensure that the procedures for evaluating learning outcomes are consistent with the planned results and goals of the educational Organization.*
* *The educational organization should ensure consistency, transparency and objectivity in the application of the mechanism for evaluating students ' academic achievements.*
* *Evaluators should be familiar with modern methods of evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area.*
* *The MEP leadership should demonstrate that there is a feedback system for using various teaching methods and evaluating learning outcomes.*
* *The MEP leadership should demonstrate support for student autonomy, while providing guidance and assistance from the teacher.*
* *The MEP management should demonstrate that there is a procedure in place to respond to student complaints.*

***Proof part***

The training process is organized in accordance with the requirements for the preparation of masters in the field of "Architecture", the MEP is compiled taking into account student-centered training, additionally includes the creation of content for extracurricular activities in special disciplines of the professional cycle.

The work of supervisors (supervisors of undergraduates) in student groups is organized on the basis of methodological guidelines developed by the department for supervisors on psychological and pedagogical support of academic groups.

Students who are citizens of other countries can receive comprehensive support both from the university through [the Department of Foreign Relations,](https://kstu.kg/otdely/otdel-mezhdunarodnykh-svjazei/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-1) and at the departments responsible for both the educational так and за educational process (minutes of the department meeting No. 5 of 20.10.2022).

Undergraduates are actively involved in the social life of the university, there is a Student Council, excursions and expeditions are organized for undergraduates. For example, on April 10 at the Sports Palace. Kaba uulu Kozhomkula students took part in the opening of the Universiade 2023, on April 20, 2023, together with the deputy directors of the IAD, IIT, IET, MVSHL and ISOP for BP, they held an action "Let's do a good deed" and visited the Sokuluk rehabilitation center for children with Disabilities, located in the village of Malovodnoye.

Educational work is managed by the Department of Educational Work.

The motivation for undergraduates to achieve high results in teaching special subjects is supported by preferential discounts on contract training for excellent students.

Leading specialists, designers, architects, and managers of architectural firms with extensive production experience are invited to the main disciplines as teaching staff.

Support for undergraduates with disabilities in need is provided in the form of a one-time financial assistance through the university's trade union committee and the provision of benefits up to 25% of the cost of the training contract. There is a Regulation on social support for students and undergraduates from 05.10.2022, which prescribes the provision of benefits up to 25%, free accommodation in the KSTU hostel, reduced-price meals, etc. The implementation of a barrier-free environment at the university for people with disabilities within the framework of the EP is not visually and documented.

Working programs of disciplines and basic учебные curricula of educational programs of the Architecture cluster allow students to choose from a list of elective disciplines (for example: курсы по elective courses). In the future , it is planned to introduce a fully individual траектории обучения student learning path from the 2023-2024 academic year, considered at the meeting of the Educational and Methodological Commission, Protocol No. 4 of 12.12.2022.

The university ведется monitors достигнутых магистрантами the learning outcomes achieved by undergraduates, which ensures the independence and objectivity of assessments. The university has [an academic calendar,](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/akademicheskii_kalendar_2022-23_uch.god_magistr_ochnaja_forma_obuchenija.pdf) according to which the educational process is conducted. There is a schedule of classes, modules, SRS, consultations and exams that are available in [системе the AVN system](https://avn.kstu.kg/) and in its application. Video recording is conducted in all classrooms where exams are held in disciplines.

Also , stakeholders, i.e. all interested parties, can attend all exams and practice results. The entire process достигнутых студентами of learning outcomes achieved by students обучения is controlled [by the Education](https://kstu.kg/otdely/uchebnoe-upravlenie) [Department](https://kstu.kg/otdely/uchebnoe-upravlenie) and отделом [the Department качества of Education Quality.](https://kstu.kg/otdely/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija)

Interactive online and offline feedback methods are used as methods and mechanisms that the university uses for joint architectural design with students, conducting experiments, developing scientific and project concepts, and managing the educational process. The university uses: student surveys, blind questionnaires, personal contacts and conversations, exchange of opinions on the pages of departments in social networks facebook, instagramm, messages in groups in messengers whatsapp, Telegram, helplines are posted and work, especially in order to prevent corruption, group and general meetings of students, discussions in the student council.

In order to organize feedback from students, the University and the Department of Architecture conducts questionnaires and surveys of students. Sociological studies of student satisfaction are conducted by the method of blind questioning in order to obtain objective data. Surveys and questionnaires can be conducted both offline on paper and online on the pages in social networks of the Department of Architecture. Directors, their deputies, supervisors and heads of departments receive comprehensive information about the educational process during personal contacts, telephone conversations and exchange of opinions in instant messengers.

***Analytical part***

In general, the Institute has demonstrated systematic development and implementation of various forms and methods of teaching and learning, including the use of innovative methods, the satisfaction of students and teaching staff with methodological innovations is monitored, however, the commission notes that it needs to improve the issues of having its own research on the methodology of teaching academic disciplines in order to develop student-centered learning within the

Students express satisfaction with the level of teaching quality, which is shown by the results of the survey - 83.6% are fully satisfied with the existing educational resources of the university-67.3%, difficult to answer-0%.

Students expressed high satisfaction with the objectivity of the assessment of knowledge, skills and other educational achievements: 81.8% were satisfied, 16.4% were partially satisfied.

Based on the results of interviews, familiarization with various documentation, material and technical base and information and methodological resources of the Institute and department, questionnaires of students and teaching staff, the VEK NAAR notes the following:

***Strengths/Best practices:***

*There are no strengths identified in this standard.*

***VEC recommendations***

***-*** Руководству ОПTo ensure a barrier-free environment for people with disabilities for the EP management. The deadline is 2023-2024 academic year.

***Conclusions of the Higher School of Economics on the criteria of the standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance":***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) of 10 parameters: no strong positions, 10 satisfactory and no parameter suggesting improvements.***

*6.6. The "Learners"Standard*

* *The educational organization should demonstrate the implementation of the student pooling policy and ensure transparency of its procedures.*
* *The MEP management should demonstrate the implementation of special adaptation and support programs for first-year students, foreign students, and mobility students.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate that its actions comply with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, including the use of a mechanism to recognize the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of formal and non-formal education.*
* *The PA should collaborate with other educational organizations and national centers of the"European Network of National Academic Recognition and Mobility Information Centers / National Academic Recognition Information Centers " ENIC / NARIC to ensure comparable recognition of qualifications.*
* *The PA should provide opportunities for external and internal mobility of MEP students, and provide assistance in obtaining external grants for training.*
* *The educational organization should encourage students to self-educate and develop outside of the main program (extracurricular activities).*
* *An important factor is the availability of a support mechanism for gifted students.*
* *The educational organization should provide students with places of practice, demonstrate the procedure for promoting employment of graduates, and maintain communication with them.*
* *Руководство MEP management should demonstrate that graduates of the program have the skills that are in demand in the labor market.*
* *The MEP management should demonstrate the use of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activities of graduates*
* *An important factor is the existence of a functioning alumni association.*

***Proof part***

The University guarantees the implementation of the policy of forming [a contingent](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/kontingent_magistrantov_vshm_2022-2023_uch._god..pdf) [of students](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/kontingent_magistrantov_vshm_2022-2023_uch._god..pdf) on the site and ensures transparency of its procedures.

The University pursues a unified policy on the formation of a contingent of students in accordance with [the license issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/licenzija_magistr.pdf) [Reeducational](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/licenzija_magistr.pdf) and the approved admission plan on the basis of state educational grants, quotas of grant places for targeted admission of applicants, as well as on a contractual basis[.](https://kstu.kg/abiturientu/1/dokumenty)

After entering the university, the student goes through an adaptation program. The schedule of the educational process reflects the period of adaptation of the student. The GSOM Director appoints supervisors and advisors in groups for the department's areas of study. In turn, advisors conduct explanatory work on the educational process. The supervisor conducts a tour of the buildings, holds a meeting in which he appoints the headman and deputy headman from among the active students by voting. the head of the group also introduces students to the university charter, the plan of work with the group, buildings, schedule and other aspects of the relevant educational process.

Persons who have completed the 6th cycle of training of the NRC in the direction of "Architecture" with the qualification "bachelor" or "specialist" are accepted to the 7th level (NRC) of study (Master's degree) in the Educational Program of the cluster "Architecture". The presence of a diploma of higher professional education with a bachelor's qualification is the basis for admission to the master's program, since such persons have passed an interdisciplinary comprehensive exam in the profile and completed. Final qualification work. An additional requirement for admission to the master's program is entrance tests for applicants.

Kyrgyzstan ratified the Lisbon Recognition Convention on 9.03.2004 and this Convention entered into force on 1 May 2004. International academic mobility within the university is conducted [by the Institute of Joint Educational Programs](https://kstu.kg/instituty/institut-sovmestnykh-obrazovatelnykh-programm) and [the Department of Foreign Relations,](https://kstu.kg/otdely/otdel-mezhdunarodnykh-svjazei/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-1) International Cooperation.

In 1998 1998 подписано [, an Agreement was signed](http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/17477) between the Government of the Reeducational of Belarus, the Government of the Reeducational of Kazakhstan, the Government of the Kyrgyz Reeducational, the Government of the Russian Federation and the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan on mutual recognition and equivalence of educational documents, academic degrees and titles, which by definition means о recognition дипломов of KSTU diplomas in the countries mentioned in the agreement . If изъявлении желания students express a desire to студентов о receive European-style diplomas (diploma supplement) and students are interested in finding employment outside the Eurasian Economic Union, KSTU issues students an appendix to диплому the European -style diploma on a paid basis according to the price list of the printing house, since KSTU has signed the Magna Charta of European Universities and is a member of the Bologna Process.

KSTU is a member of the International Association of Construction Universities of the CIS, a member [of the Eurasian-Pacific network of universities UNINET](https://www.eurasiapacific.net/), was accepted into [Magna](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/vneshnie-svjazi/1-kolonka/otdel-mezhdunarodnykh-svjazei-i-akademicheskoi-mobilnosti/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju%22%20%5Cl%20%22%3A~%3Atext%3DTHE%20Magna%20Carta%20of%20Universities%20is%20a%20document%2C%25) Carta of European Universities.

There are links with educational programs of the following international organizations and institutions: [IREX](https://www.irex.org/), [ACCELS,](https://kyrgyzstan.americancouncils.org/russian-about) [German Academic Exchange Service](https://www.daad-kyrgyzstan.org/ru/o-nas/o-daad/), SOROS, USAID, UNESCO. KSTU is a performer of a number проектов of TEMPUS, ERASMUS+, Erasmus Mundus and TACIS projects of the European Commission; projects программы [of the DAAD program.](https://www.daad-kyrgyzstan.org/ru/o-nas/o-daad/) The University is the national coordinator of the project of the network of universities стран-участников of the SCO member states.

The University, within the framework of cluster 5 "Architecture", has an agreement on academic mobility of students with the Moscow State University of программам подготовки Civil Engineering for bachelor 's and master's degree programs "2+2", "4+2", "0+2", "1+1" in construction and architectural areas: [foreign partners of MGSU](http://mgsu.ru/universityabout/Mezdunar-deyat/zarubezhnye-partnery/), in particular: Hungary hosted the first Forum of Rectors of Kyrgyz and Hungarian universities, which was held 13-14 февраля on February 13-14 г. in Budapest, Hungary, on the basis of which cooperation agreements were signed. [The Forum was held during the official visit](https://kstu.kg/news-ru?tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=3083&cHash=bbf7b810238cb0fd6770cae3b31172c5) [Венгрию of President of the Kyrgyz Republic Жапарова S. N. Zhaparov to Hungary.](https://kstu.kg/news-ru?tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=3083&cHash=bbf7b810238cb0fd6770cae3b31172c5)

The place of internship is determined by the graduating department and assigned to students by an agreement with basic organizations and enterprises, or it is proposed by the student-intern on the basis of a request letter from the organization (enterprise) and agreed with the head of the department. 25 organizations and enterprises have signed contracts on the bases of design and technological, design and pre-graduate practice, such as the Ak-Bashat Design Institute LLC, the State Institute of Urban Planning and Architecture of the Alamudun District Administration, Bishkek Glavarkhitektura, etc.

Skills, abilities and competencies of graduates are formed solely on the basis of requests from potential consumers, regulated by the labor market. Requests of the state and society are met by meeting the requirements [of the State Higher Professional](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/gos_vpo_750100_arkhitektura__magistr_2.pdf) Education Standard in the direction 750100 - "Architecture". In order to identify the needs of potential consumers of educational programs in the areas кластера of the Architecture clusterна регулярной осонове организовываются [, extended meetings and](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/rezoljucija_kruglogo_stola_1.pdf) [round tables are organized on](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/rezoljucija_kruglogo_stola_1.pdf) a regular один basis once a year, based on the results of the defense of the Final qualification work.

KSTU operates a [Career and Practice Center,](https://kstu.kg/studentu/centr-karery/cukic) where there are practical training bases проводится [мониторинг , graduate employment is monitored выпускников](https://kstu.kg/studentu/centr-karery/monitoring-trudoustroistva-vypusknikov) , and предлагаются current vacancies are offered. [Employment of graduates](https://kstu.kg/bokovoe-menju/instituty/institut-arkhitektury-i-dizaina/arkhitektura/fyafyay) is one of the most important criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of the university's activities in the educational services market. When there are disproportions of supply and demand in the labor market, KSTU is interested in improving the understanding and monitoring of the employment of its graduates. The Career and Practice Center of KSTU is a key link between the university and employers . To assist in finding internship and employment opportunities, the Career and Practice Center is constantly ведет working to expand the network of strategic partners: to date [в базе , the University](https://kstu.kg/studentu/centr-karery/baza-dannykh-predprijatii-i-organizacii) has more than 260 [enterprises and](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/vypuskniku/baza-dannykh-rabotadatelei) [organizations in its database](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/vypuskniku/baza-dannykh-rabotadatelei).

There is a mechanism for supporting gifted students. The Department of Architecture participates in the implementation of research results of gifted and talented students, as well as popularizes them through scientific research by coordinating research plans, organizing joint scientific research, jointly holding scientific conferences, meetings and publishing scientific papers on individual problems, and jointly participating in international and national architectural competitions. The Department of Architecture publishes scientific papers, collections of reports of scientific conferences, educational and methodical manuals made by especially gifted students (Table 5).

Table 5-Number of published articles by faculty members and undergraduates of the Department of Architecture

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Academic year | 2018-2019 | 2019-2020 | 2020-2021  | 2021-2022 | 2022-2023  |
| Number of published articles by faculty and undergraduates of the Department of Architecture | 12 | 22 | 33 | 26 | 23 |

***Analytical part***

The EP management encourages [students](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/kontingent_magistrantov_750500.pdf) to self-educate and develop outside of the main program. Educational programs provide for independent training of students outside the main program. Self-development and self-education is based on the principles of the scientific method, including analytical and critical thinking. One of the most important tasks of the educational program is to train students of the 7th cycle of the NRC in scientific activities and develop their skills to use the principles of the scientific method. The faculty of the Department of Architecture formulates a problem for the master's student, and he independently searches for its solution using the scientific method. Teaching staff trains a master's student to analyze the information received, compare facts, and group them. The teaching staff explains the relationship between previous and new knowledge gained during the research of the chosen topic. The actions of the teaching staff consist in explaining to the student the 7 cycle goals of working on the topic under study, analyzing and critically reviewing the information received. The student can independently conduct experiments, receive the results of their research, and draw appropriate conclusions. In this way, students have academic freedom in their research and in the choice of research topics. The master's student can suggest a topic for their future research work.

Articles of faculty members and undergraduates of the Department of Architecture are published in the scientific journal Vestnik KSTU, in the International Collection of proceedings Satbaev University, Almaty, in the collection of scientific papers of undergraduates and students of KSTU named after I. Razzakov, in the collection of materials of the International Scientific and Practical Conference " Innovations in Engineering and Technologies (ISPCIET-2021)", Veliky Novgorod and etc.

The management of the EP provides students with places of practice, demonstrates the procedure for promoting employment of graduates, maintaining communication with them. The management of the EP demonstrated the maximum amount of effort for the employment of graduates of the EP "Architecture", the percentage of employment is high. KSTU hosts career and practice days on a regular basis.

Employers noted that graduates of the program have skills that are in demand in the labor market.

However, the commission of the Higher Economic Commission notes that the reports indicate that the public association "Alumni Association" operates in KSTU, but в рамках ОП they did not see any documented activities within the framework of the EP. The aim of the alumni Association is to develop partnerships between graduates and preserve the unity of values and interests. The EP management should pay attention to strengthening the interaction of graduates with the alumni association within the framework of the EP.

***Strengths/Best practices:***

1. Availability of procedures and measures to encourage students to self-education and development outside the main program;

2. Availability of a mechanism and implementation of support for gifted students;

3. Graduates of the EP have developed skills that are in demand in the labor market, and a high level of employment.

***WEC recommendations:***

Conduct a set of measures to attract students and graduates of recent years to the activities of the Association of Graduates of the EP in order to exchange experience and actively participate in the development of the EP from the 2024-2025 academic year.

***Conclusions of the Higher School of Economics on the criteria of the standard "Students":***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) out of 11 parameters: 3 have strong positions, 7 are satisfactory, and 1 parameter suggests improvement.***

*6.7. Standard "Teaching staff"*

* *The educational organization demonstrates the implementation of an objective and transparent HR policy to ensure the quality of educational education.*
* *The MEP management must demonstrate the implementation of a personnel policy that includes hiring, professional growth, and development of personnel that ensure the professional competence of the entire staff.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate that the quality of teaching staff meets the established qualification requirements, the institutional strategy, and the goals of the MEP.*
* *MEP management should demonstrate that adequate funding is being provided for PPP development.*
* *MEP management should demonstrate an awareness of responsibility for its employees, including young teachers, and ensure that they enjoy favorable working conditions, career opportunities, and professional development.*
* *The MEP leadership should demonstrate the wide use of information and communication technologies and software tools by teaching staff in the educational process (for example, on-line training, e-portfolio, MOHSs, etc.).*
* *The educational organization should demonstrate the focus of its activities on the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.*
* *The educational organization should involve in teaching specialists of the relevant branches of the economy who have professional competencies that meet the requirements of the MEP.*
* *The PA should determine the contribution of the MEP faculty to the implementation of the country's institutional development, science and technology strategy.*
* *The management must demonstrate the involvement of each teacher, including invited teachers, in promoting a culture of quality and academic integrity in the OO, and in achieving the goals of the OO.*

***Proof part***

KSTU guarantees the implementation of an objective and transparent HR policy to ensure the quality of MEP.

Full-time teaching staff are appointed to the corresponding positions of a teacher, senior lecturer, associate professor and professor by the Rector of the university on the recommendation of the head of the department, who is the head of the educational program. Further, applicants are selected by competition at the KSTU Academic Council by secret ballot for a period of 5 years. Masters have the right to hold the positions of teacher and senior teacher with further selection by competition, but without the right to give lectures. Candidates of Science (PhD) have the right to hold the position of associate professor, and doctors of science have the right to hold the position of professor with subsequent election by competition. External and internal part-timers are accepted to the corresponding positions by the Rector of the University on the recommendation of the head of the department in accordance with a fixed-term employment contract for a period of 1 year.

Teaching [staff is administered by Human Resources Management (HR-service)](https://kstu.kg/otdely/otdel-kadrov) on the basis of the following regulatory legal acts of the Kyrgyz Reeducational and local regulatory legal acts of KSTU:

* [The Labor Code of the Kyrgyz Reeducational;](http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/1505)
* [Law on Education of the Kyrgyz Republic;](http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/1216?cl=ru-ru)

 [- Regulations on the procedure for filling positions of teaching staff of higher education institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic;](http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/96049)

 [- Regulations on the procedure for organizing and holding a competition to fill the positions](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_o_porjadke_organizacii_i_proved) [of teaching staff;](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_o_porjadke_organizacii_i_proved)

- [Regulations on the organization of the educational process at KSTU named after I. Razzakov based](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_ob_organizacii_uch.processa_v_kgtu_na_osnove_kso_ects_2022.pdf) [on the credit system ob. ECTS\_2022;](https://kstu.kg/fileadmin/user_upload/polozhenie_ob_organizacii_uch.processa_v_kgtu_na_osnove_kso_ects_2022.pdf)

-[Regulations on the rules for attracting an invited specialist to the scientific](https://kstu.kg/otdel/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/lo) [and educational process of KSTU named after I. Razzakov;](https://kstu.kg/otdel/otdel-kachestva-obrazovanija/lo)

* [Regulations on the Commission on Labor Discipline and Ethics of KSTU named after I. Razzakov;](https://kstu.kg/dovuzovskaja-podgotovka/politekhnicheskii-kolledzh/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-1)
* [ПRegulation on the Department охраны of Labor Protection техники Safety and Civil Protection](https://kstu.kg/dovuzovskaja-podgotovka/politekhnicheskii-kolledzh/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-1) [of KSTU;](https://kstu.kg/dovuzovskaja-podgotovka/politekhnicheskii-kolledzh/zagolovok-po-umolchaniju-1)

- Individual план teacher's plan;

* Годовой отчет The teacher's annual report;
* Annual контракт на employment contract.

According штатному to the staffing schedule of KSTU for the 2022-2023 academic year, на 3 full – time units are planned for the cluster of the Architecture educational program «Архитектура» уровня at the Master's level запланировано штатных единиц – , which is 2,135 academic hours.

The qualitative composition of the teaching кластера staff of the Architecture cluster, which implements the educational program, is on average 92% of those with academic degrees of Doctor of Architecture, candidate of Architecture.

According [to the Development Strategy of KSTU](https://kstu.kg/universitet/2-kolonka/missija-universiteta/programma-strategii-razvitija-kgtu-im-irazzakova) and the tasks set by the Founder in connection with giving KSTU a "special status", the university should be included in the QS of Asian universities. To do this ППС кафедры , the overwhelming majority of the faculty of the Architecture своем Department must have publications that are indexed by scientific information aggregators SCOPUS, Web of Science, ORCID, google scholar, etc., as well as the Hirsch index. KSTU should attract professors who have a high professional and academic reputation, not only within Kyrgyzstan, but also from outside the Kyrgyz Republic. The university should have both entrance так and exit programs for academic mobility of professors and students.

Scientists of the department for 2018-2023 published articles: 4 Scopus, 1 Web of Science, 20 RSCI and more than 10 articles in the collections of scientific works of KSUSTA, KRSU, KSTU. Publications of the article. Over the past 5 years, several monographs, 2 textbooks, and 7 teaching aids have been published. Master's students of the department have published more than 40 scientific articles on the chosen topic of their master's thesis since 2018-2023.

It is worth noting that KSTU has subscribed to the above-mentioned aggregators in 2022, and идут negotiations are underway with Elsevier (SCOPUS) and Clarivate (WoSc) to include Izvestiya KSTU and Vestnik KSTU magazines (КГТУ) in the database of the main aggregators. Indexing will allow increasing the criteria indicators of PPP, which ultimately will lead to full compliance of PPP with the goals of the institutional strategy.

The university has a system of bonuses for the presence of an academic degree, so that the corresponding positions of associate professor or professor can be occupied by persons with ученой the degree of candidate (PhD) or doctor (DSc, DHab) of sciences, and official salaries in these categories have a higher university allowance. After defending their dissertations, the university awards applicants with a one-time payment of financial resources. Moreover, the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic has established additional [allowances for academic](http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/11738) [degrees of candidate and doctor of Sciences.](http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/11738)

From 9.01.2023-20.01.2023 KSTU held professional development courses on the topic: Project management: "Modern problems of architecture and urban planning in Kyrgyzstan" on the initiative of lecturer D. arch., Professor D. D. Omuralieva-92 hours. As well as advanced training courses are held, for example, at the State Agency for Construction and Architecture under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic for professional activity as an architect for urban planning, for professional activity as an architect for industrial and civil construction, and for professional activity as an architect – project manager (GAPa). Similar courses are also held on the basis of related universities and in KSTU itself. The State Agency for Intellectual Property "Kyrgyzpatent" regularly conducts various courses and trainings on intellectual property, innovative technologies and the basics of inventive activity. For example: on December 8-9, 2022, and January 25-26, 2023, faculty members of the department completed qualification courses in Kyrgyzpatent and received certificates.

The Department of Architecture has written textbooks "Architectural Analytics", "Ethnoarchitecture", "History of Architecture of Kyrgyzstan" in the 2022-2023 academic year. 3 more textbooks and a study guide for architectural students are being prepared.

The university has a contract with the American company Autodesk and uses free student versions of the company's products on a long-term basis: AutoCAD, AutoCAD LT, Autodesk Revit, Autodesk Robot Structural Analysis, AutoCAD Civil 3D, Autodesk BIM 360.

The computers are equipped with modern software with the Microsoft Windows 10 operating system and the corresponding Microsoft Office 2010, 2013 package. Also, depending on the subjects taught, students are trained to work with software packages: Photoshop CC 5, CorelDRAW X5, AutoCAD 2013, ArchiCAD 25, etc..

The university provides pro-access to programs that allow you to conduct classes in on-line format ZOOM, Jitsi Meet, Microsoft Teams. Stable high-speed Internet is installed in computer classrooms. Free, available software packages, installed programs from AUTODESK and GrafiSoft.

The University guarantees the focus of its activities on the development of academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers.

For students of the EP "Architecture" cluster привлекаются , teachers from: [Kazakh архитектурно-строительная Academy of Architecture and Civil Engineering,](https://ru.wikipedia.org/wiki/%D0%9A%D0%B0%D0%B7%D0%B0%D1%85%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B0%D1%8F_%D0%B3%D0%BE%D0%BB%D0%BE%D0%B2%D0%BD%D0%B0%D1%8F_%D0%B0%D1%80%D1%85%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%B5%D0%BA%D1%82%D1%83%D1%80%D0%BD%D0%BE-%D1%81%D1%82%D1%80%D0%BE%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%B5%D0%BB%D1%8C%D0%BD%D0%B0%D1%8F_%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B4%D0%B5%D0%BC%D0%B8%D1%8F)

- [Kazakh State Technical University named after K. Satbayev.](https://satbayev.university/ru)

- [Kazan State архитектурно-строительный University of Architecture and Civil Engineering,](https://www.kgasu.ru/)

* [Moscow Architectural Institute,](https://marhi.ru/)

[- Tyumen Industrial University,](https://www.tyuiu.ru/)

* Таджикский технический университет M. Osimi Tajik Technical University,
* [Jalal-Abad Государственнный State University,](https://www.google.com/search?q=-%2BДжалал-Абадский%2BГосударственнный%2Bуниверситет%2C&rlz=1C1)
* [Osh технологический University of Technology](http://oshtu.kg/);
* [Kyrgyz-Russian Slavic University.](https://www.krsu.edu.kg/)
* [Kyrgyz National University named after Zh. Balasagyn.](https://www.google.com/search?q=-%2BКыргызский%2BНациональный%2Bуниверситет%2Bим.%2BЖ.%2BБаласагына)
* open lectures by specialists of private architectural companies and state institutions and agencies in construction and architecture.

At the moment, only agreements between universities have been drawn up and signed, and it is planned to attract teachers and the terms of their invitation.

In 2018, within the framework of academic mobility, teachers of the Department of Architecture, Doctor of Architecture, prof.Omuraliev D. D., Candidate of Architecture, Associate Professor Taskulov U. B., were invited to give lectures at Osh Technological University. As a result of their trips, close ties with the named university were established. In 2023, Associate Professor S. T. Kozhobaeva also gave a series of guest lectures at OshTU.

Attracting teachers from related universities within Kyrgyzstan is based on the mechanism of joint teaching staff, which has a permanent and well-established character. The list of partners for attracting foreign professors has been published. [on the website.](../../../../Downloads/%D0%BD%D0%B0%20%D1%81%D0%B0%D0%B9%D1%82%D0%B5.) Наши партнеры [https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/vneshnie-svjazi/mezhdunarodnyi-](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/vneshnie-svjazi/mezhdunarodnyi-otdel/vuzy) [otdel/vuzy](https://kstu.kg/glavnoe-menju/vneshnie-svjazi/mezhdunarodnyi-otdel/vuzy).

***Analytical part***

In the course of meeting and interviewing employees and teaching staff, they expressed satisfaction with the current personnel policy at KSTU and confirmed the fact of holding a competition for vacant positions. The website of the university provides complete information about the teaching staff of the department. The personnel potential of the teaching staff corresponds to the development strategy of the university and the specifics of the EP.

The manual demonstrates the involvement of each teacher, including invited ones, in promoting a culture of quality and academic integrity at the university, and in achieving the goals of the EP.

The Higher School of Economics notes the high research and publication activity of the teaching staff, as well as the active work of teaching staff to improve their own skills in the country and abroad.

 The University has an objective and transparent personnel policy. Experts note that the staff of the teaching staff of the Higher Education Department is staffed in accordance with the legislation of the Republic and the Rules for competitive replacement of positions of scientific and pedagogical personnel of higher educational institutions.

KSTU implements a plan to improve the skills of teaching staff, develops academic mobility within the country, but the university does not have wide financial opportunities to attract external professors from foreign countries on a permanent basis. Attracting teachers from related universities within Kyrgyzstan is based on the mechanism of joint teaching staff, which has a permanent and well-established character.

The EP leadership demonstrated targeted actions for the development of young teachers.

Teachers who participate in the implementation of accredited educational programs take an active part in various public, scientific, methodological, research, cultural and other events in the region and the Republic.

According to the results of a survey of teaching staff of accredited specialties, 33.3% rated the involvement of teaching staff in the process of making managerial and strategic decisions at a very good level and 63.6% at a good level. Teaching staff rated the promotion of innovation activity at a very good level-42.4% and a good level-48.5%.

***Strengths/Best practices:***

1. The correspondence of the personnel potential of the teaching staff to the university development strategy and the specifics of the EP.

2. Involvement of teaching staff in the life of society (the role of teaching staff in the education system, in the development of science, the region, creating a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, etc.).

***VEC recommendations***

*Missing items*

***Conclusions of the Higher School of Economics on the criteria of the standard "Teaching staff":***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) out of 10 parameters: 2 have strong positions, 8 are satisfactory and there is no parameter suggesting improvements.***

*6.8. Standard "Educational resources and student Support Systems"*

* *The educational organization must ensure that educational resources, including the material and technical base, and infrastructure meet the goals of the MEP.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate that information resources meet the needs of the MEP, including in the following areas:*
* *technological support for students and teaching staff in accordance with the main educational program (for example, on-line training, modeling, databases, data analysis programs).*
* *library resources, including the collection of educational, methodological and scientific literature on general education, basic and profile disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to scientific databases;*

*examination of research results, graduation papers, and dissertations for plagiarism;*

*access to online educational resources;*

*Operation of Wi-FI on the territory of a educational organization.*

* *The educational organization must demonstrate the availability of conditions for conducting research, publishing research results of teaching staff, employees and students, and integrating science and education.*
* *The educational organization should demonstrate the practical implementation of measures to provide the MEP with educational equipment, software, and analogs used in the relevant sectors of the economy.*
* *MEP management should demonstrate that there are procedures in place to support various groups of students, including informing and advising them.*
* *The MEP guidelines should show that there are conditions for the student's progress along the individual educational path.*
* *The educational organization must demonstrate that the infrastructure meets the security requirements.*

***Proof part***

 In the educational process for cluster 5 of the Architecture educational program используются , a sufficient number of classrooms are used, equipped with modern information and demonstration tools and computer equipment, as well as design and layout equipment (Table 2).

For a full-fledged training of a master's student, you need a material and technical base, laboratory installations, a design office, mock-up workshops, etc.

The Department of Architecture has educational and research experimental design facilities on Campus 2, on the 5th and 7th floors. The total area of the premises is 594 sq. m., this allows you to organize a normal educational process.

The cluster of educational programs "Architecture" is physically localized in the campus named after him. Isanov, where there is a wide use of teaching staff of information and communication technologies and software tools in the educational process.

The products mentioned above are used for architectural design, competitive design, visualization, calculation and structural analysis of buildings, structures and объектов infrastructure на facilities based концепции [on the BIM-technology concept.](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Building_information_modeling) For кластера the EP "Architecture" cluster организована , computer classes are organized in room 1/702.

Within the framework of the EP program, the teaching staff determines the following requirements for the study and implementation of computer programs:

- Designing in the graphic programs ArchiCAD, Auto Cad, 3DSX, Corel DRAW, Artlantis Studio, Photoshop;

- Combine the acquired skills with other architectural programs;

- Have experience working with a library of textures and models, searching on the Internet.

- Designing various objects with a full set of working drawings.

The university provides pro-access to programs that allow you to conduct classes in on-line format ZOOM, Jitsi Meet, Microsoft Teams. Stable high-speed Internet in computer classrooms. Free software packages of installed programs from AUTODESK and GrafiSoft are available.

ЭThe electronic library for the "Architecture" cluster was created at the Library and Information Center (BIC) of the campus . Isanov, which is part of the Научнотехническую Scientific and Technical Library of KSTU. Since 2008 2008 , the university has been included in the International European Project and entered into the implementation of the project "Exchange of library and information resources between University libraries of Kyrgyzstan" [KYRLIBNET-UM-JEP-26219-2005 TEMPUS - TACIS](https://kyrlibnet.kg/ru/) (in partnership with the European Union) [https://kyrlibnet.kg/ru/.5796280](https://kyrlibnet.kg/ru/)

The electronic library allows students and teachers кластера of the EP "Architecture" cluster to use the library fund, which significantly speeds up and improves the conditions for preparing for classes and conducting research. There is also an [AVN information system,](https://avn.kstu.kg/) available both as a [web site](https://avn.kstu.kg/) and as a mobile application for viewing and copying lectures, методических manuals and test tasks in disciplines taught at university departments. New technologies are used as a tool for improving and интеграции integrating scientific and educational programs . For this purpose, the university has access to the kyrlibnet Association of Electronic Libraries [.kg](http://kyrlibnet.kg/ru/) Кыргызстана.

***Analytical part***

The information provided by the university on the specified EP on material, technical and information resources shows a tendency to improve.

As a result of the analysis of the activities of accredited CS under this standard, it can be concluded that the assessment of completeness and availability of material, technical and information resources specified by the CS was carried out. There is a dynamic of resources and the learning environment, library support for the educational process, and measures aimed by the EP management at improving the resource support for the implementation of the EP are highlighted.

When carrying out educational activities, the university is guided by regulatory documents regulating mandatory regulatory requirements for the material and technical, educational and laboratory facilities of educational organizations. There is a fairly good level of information support for educational and scientific-educational activities with access to full-text electronic resources of educational and scientific significance, which meets the needs of students and teaching staff.

***Strengths/Best practices:***

There are no strengths identified in this standard.

***VEC recommendations***

*Missing items*

***Conclusions of the Higher School of Economics on the criteria of the standard "Educational resources and student Support Systems":***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) of 11 parameters: no strong positions, 11 satisfactory and no parameter suggesting improvements.***

*6.9. "Informing the Public"Standard*

* *The educational organization must demonstrate that the web resource reflects reliable, objective, and up-to-date information that reflects all areas of activity within the MEP.*
* *educational awareness should include support and clarification of national development programs and the system of higher professional education.*
* *The educational organization should use a variety of ways of informing the general educational and interested persons (including mass media, web resources, information networks, etc.).*
* *Management should ensure that information is informed based on the following MEP indicators:*
* *the purpose and planned results of the MEP, the qualification awarded in accordance with the NSC, QF-EHEA;*

*information about the system for evaluating students ' academic achievements;*

*information about academic mobility programs and other forms of cooperation with partner universities and employers;*

*information about opportunities for developing students ' personal and professional competencies and employment;*

*data reflecting the positioning of MEP in the educational services market (at the regional, national, and international levels).*

* *The PA should ensure that the audited financial statements are published in the context of the PA on its own web resource.*
* *An important factor is**the publication on open resources of information about teaching staff, in the context of personnel.*
* *An important factor is the publication of information about cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific / consulting organizations, business and social partners, and other educational organizations.*
* *The educational organization should ensure that information and links to resources based on the results of external evaluation are published.*

***Proof part***

Theofficial [website of the university](https://kstu.kg/) contains reliable information for all groups of stakeholders, reflects various aspects of academic, scientific, methodological, educational activities of the university and departments, news, regulatory legal acts, both local так and national level in terms of education and science. Important information is duplicated on the resources: educational portal: [avn.kstu.kg](https://avn.kstu.kg/); distance learning center: [сdeksucta.kg](https://www.cdeksucta.kg/)**;** mobile app: "AVN".2332355

Важным инструментом доведения до сведения заинтересованных сторон The "News" section of the university's website, which is available on the main page, is an important tool for communicating information about changes taking place at the university to interested parties [сайта университета,](https://kstu.kg/). Independent media outlets also publish information about the activities кафедры of the Architecture Department, проводимых events held, achievements and general information about the educational process for applicants.

The University uses various methods of informing числе the general public and interested persons (including mass media, web resources, information networks , etc.) широкой общественности и заинтересованных . Информирование Public information is provided on the official website of the University, which is administered [by the IT Department.](https://kstu.kg/otdely/otdel-it-departament/sostav-otdela) KSTU has a [press center](https://kstu.kg/universitet/1-kolonka/press-sekrktar). The University conducts various PR campaigns in independent media, holds press conferences of the Faculty of the Department of Architecture. Активно используют площадки The following social media platforms are actively used : facebook, twitter, youtube, instagram, tiktok.

НThe university's website университета actively publishes information about interactions with national and international partners, universities, the business community, and key stakeholders. Publications are placed in разделе the "News" section of the official website. [An example of a similar publication](https://kstu.kg/news-ru?tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=3083&cHash=bbf7b810238cb0fd6770cae3b31172c5) about partners in Hungary, or [collaboratively with Akita University in Japan.](https://kstu.kg/news-ru?tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=3086&cHash=ea91b3df2bac584ba3261cecf485221b) The news archive is not deleted and is always publicly available.

***Analytical part***

The university manages information on accredited educational programs at a fairly high level. The EP management uses a variety of information dissemination methods, including mass media, information and social networks to inform the general public and interested parties.

Members of the commission note the availability on the university's website of objective and up-to-date information within the framework of the EP, including: implemented EP, indicating the expected learning outcomes; information on the possibility of awarding qualifications at the end of the EP; information on various opportunities provided to students; information on the achievements of the teaching staff of the EP.

Members of the commission paid special attention to the availability of information about students ' achievements on the university's website on the pages of departments implementing the EP.

The university has well-organized and virtually proven activities of the EP and teaching staff management in social networks, in the university press center and in the media.

Assessment of satisfaction with information about the university's activities, specifics and progress in implementing the EP is carried out regularly and systematically through questionnaires, surveys, feedback, as well as through the rector's blog.

***Strengths/best practices***

There are no strengths identified in this standard.

***VEC recommendations***

*Missing items*

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria of the "Informing the Public" standard:***

***EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) of 12 parameters: no strong positions, 12 satisfactory and no parameter suggesting improvements.***

#  OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS/ BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD

**Standard "Management of the main educational program"**

The author demonstrates the individuality and uniqueness of the educational development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and the development strategy of the educational organization.

**Information Management and Reporting Standard**

Not detected

**Standard "Development and approval of the main educational program"**

1. Demonstrated the collegiality of the development and quality assurance of the EP with the participation of students, teaching staff and employers.

2. The content of the EP is developed taking into account the volume of theoretical training, research, and professional practice.

**Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the main educational program"**

Not detected

**Standard "Students"**

1. There is a procedure for stimulating students to self-education and development outside the main program;

2. Availability of a support mechanism for gifted students;

3. The management of the EP provides students with places of practice, demonstrates the procedure for promoting employment of graduates, maintaining communication with them;

 4. Employers noted that graduates of the program have skills that are in demand in the labor market.

**Standard "Teaching staff"**

1. The correspondence of the personnel potential of the teaching staff to the university development strategy and the specifics of the EP.

2. Involvement of teaching staff in the life of society (the role of teaching staff in the education system, in the development of science, the region, creating a cultural environment, participation in exhibitions, creative competitions, etc.).

**Standard "Educational resources and student Support systems"**

Not detected

**Public Awareness Standard**

Not detected

#  OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING QUALITY

**Standard "Management of the main educational program"**

1. The EP management should consider the possibility of implementing a two-degree education within the framework of an accredited EP.

2. Develop a roadmap for academic mobility of students. The deadline is 2023-2024 academic year.

**Information Management and Reporting Standard**

The EP management should implement a mechanism for ensuring information protection, including identifying those responsible for the accuracy and timeliness of information provision.

**Standard "Development and approval of the main educational program"**

Missing items

**Standard "Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of the main educational program"**

The EP management should regularly ensure that information about any planned or undertaken actions related to the implementation of the EP is published in various media outlets. Based on the results of reviewing and making changes to the EP, ensure that the results of the changes made are published on the university's website.

**Standard "Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic performance"**

Missing items

**Standard "Students"**

Conduct a series of "round tables" with recent graduates to exchange experience and create an alumni association.

**Standard "Teaching staff"**

Missing items

**Public Awareness Standard**

Missing items

# OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF AN EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

There are no EC recommendations related to the development of educational organizations.

# RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

The external Expert Commission made a unanimous decision to recommend the educational program 750100 Architecture (Master's degree)to the Accreditation Council Institutions" Kyrgyz State Technical University named after I. Razzakov " should be accredited for a period of 5 (five) years.

# Appendix 1. Evaluation table "PROGRAM PROFILE PARAMETERS"

**Conclusion of the external expert commission on the quality assessment of the educational program EP 750100 Architecture (Master's degree) Kyrgyz State Technical University named after I. Razzakov**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **n\n** | **Evaluation #** | **Criteria** | **Educational organization standing** |
| **Strong** | **Satisfactory** | **Requires improvement** | **Unsatisfa-ctory** |
| **Standard 1. Management of main educational program 1** |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  | educational organization must have a published quality assurance policy that reflects the relationship between research, teaching and learning |  | **+** |  |  |
| 2 |  | The educational organization should demonstrate the functioning of the internal quality assurance system that contributes to the implementation of the quality assurance policy of the MEP |  | **+** |  |  |
| 3 |  | The educational organization should demonstrate a clear definition of those responsible for business processes in the MEP quality assurance, delineation of the functions of collegiate bodies |  | **+** |  |  |
| 4 |  | Management should provide evidence of the transparency of the MEP management mechanism, including risk planning and identification, resource allocation  |  | **+** |  |  |
| 5 |  | The educational organization should demonstrate the functioning of mechanisms for forming and regularly reviewing the MEP development plan, monitoring its implementation |  | **+** |  |  |
| 6 |  | The educational organization should ensure transparency in the development of the MEP development plan by involving representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and teaching |  | **staff+** |  |  |
| 7 |  | Management should demonstrate the individuality of the MEP development plan, its consistency with national development priorities and development strategy GS | **+** |  |  |  |
| 8 |  | Commitment to quality assurance should apply to any activity performed by contractors and partners (outsourcing), including in the implementation of joint / two-degree education and academic mobility |  |  | **+** |  |
| 9 |  | GS should demonstrate innovation management within the framework of the MEP, including the analysis and implementation of innovative proposals |  | **+** |  |  |
| 10 |  | Management should demonstrate its competence in in educational management programs |  | **+** |  |  |
| 11 |  | the following areas: 11 MEP management should strive to ensure that progress made since the last external quality assessment procedure is taken into account when preparing for the next procedure+ |  | **+** |  |  |
| **Total according to standard** | 1 | 9 | 1 | 0 |
| **Standard 2. Information management and reporting** |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  | The PA should demonstrate the functioning of the mechanism for collecting, analyzing and managing information based on the use of modern information and communication technologies and software tools  |  | + |  |  |
| 13 |  | The PA management should demonstrate the systematic use of processed, adequate information to improve the internal quality assurance system |  | + |  |  |
| 14 |  | The Management should show functioning of the reporting mechanism, including assessment of the effectiveness of the MEP, the activities of structural divisions within the framework of quality  |  | assurance + |  |  |
| 15 |  | The educational organization should determine the frequency, forms and methods of evaluating the management of the MEP, the activities of collegiate bodies and structural divisions, the implementation of scientific projects |  | + |  |  |
| 16 |  | The educational organization should demonstrate the implementation of the information security mechanism, including the identification of responsible persons for timely provision of information |  |  | + |  |
| 17 |  | The PA should show the involvement of trainees, employees and staff in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, as well as making decisions based on them |  | + |  |  |
| 18 |  | The PA management should demonstrate the existence of communication mechanisms with trainees, employees and other stakeholders, including conflict resolution |  | + |  |  |
| 19 |  | The PA should measure the degree of satisfaction with the needs of staff, students and staff in order to ensure the quality of the MEP and demonstrate evidence of the elimination of detected shortcomings |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | *The information collected and analyzed by the university within the framework of the MEP should take into account:* |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  | key performance indicators  |  | + |  |  |
| 21 |  | dynamics of the student body in terms of forms and types of training |  | + |  |  |
| 22 |  | level of academic performance, student achievements and expulsions |  | + |  |  |
| 23 |  | satisfaction of students with the quality of the implementation of the MEP, training in the PA |  | + |  |  |
| 24 |  | availability of educational resources and support systems for students |  | + |  |  |
| 25 |  | employment and career growth of graduates |  | + |  |  |
| 26 |  | Management should ensure the functioning of the information mechanism |  | + |  |  |
| 27 The MEP |  | leadership should facilitate the provision of all relevant information in the relevant fields of science |  | and technology.+ |  |  |
| **Total according to standard** | 0 | 15 | 1 | 0 |
| **Standard 3. Development and approval of the main educational programs** |  |  |  |  |
| 28 |  | The PA should demonstrate the existence of a documented procedure for the development, approval, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the effectiveness of the MEP at the institutional level |  | + |  |  |
| 29 |  | The PA should demonstrate the collegiality of the development and quality assurance of the MEP (participation of students, faculty and other stakeholders) | + |  |  |  |
| 30 |  | Management must demonstrate external expertise of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | *Management must demonstrate that the content of the MEP meets the established goals and expected learning outcomes:* |  | + |  |  |
| 31 |  | development of the MEP based on a student-centered approach to teaching and learning, the State Educational System of the Kyrgyz |  | Republic+ |  |  |
| 32 |  | certainty of the program structure based on the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS)  |  | + |  |  |
| 33 |  | development of the content of the MEP c  |  | + |  |  |
| 34 |  | correspondence of the content of academic disciplines and learning outcomes to each other and to the corresponding level of study (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies) determined by the NSC, QF-EHEA |  | + |  |  |
| 35 |  | validity of the influence of disciplines and their focus on ensuring the development of expected results by each student |  | + |  |  |
| 36 |  | development of procedures for evaluating academic achievements students, including final certification |  | + |  |  |
| 37 |  | An important factor is the ability to prepare students for professional certification |  | + |  |  |
| 38 |  | Management should demonstrate the existence of a model of a MEP graduate describing learning outcomes and personal qualities |  | + |  |  |
| 39 |  | Management should demonstrate the uniqueness of MEP, its positioning in the educational market, (regional/ national/ international) |  | + |  |  |
| 40 |  | An important factor is the presence of a two-degree and / or joint EP with foreign universities and demonstration of their practical implementation |  | + |  |  |
| **Standard total** | 1 | 12 | 0 | 0 |
| **Standard 4. Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of core educational programs** |  |  |  |  |
| 41 |  | Management should demonstrate that there is a documented monitoring and periodic evaluation procedure in place to achieve the goal of MEP and continuously improve its content |  | + |  |  |
| 42 |  | Management should demonstrate the effectiveness of monitoring and periodic evaluation of MEP |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | *Monitoring and periodic evaluation of the MEP should consider:* |  |  |  |  |
| 43 |  | the content of the program in the context of the latest achievements in science and technology in a particular discipline |  | + |  |  |
| 44 |  | changes in the needs of society and the professional environment |  | + |  |  |
| 45 |  | the load, academic performance and graduation of students |  | + |  |  |
| 46 |  | the effectiveness of procedures for evaluating students ' academic achievements |  | + |  |  |
| 47 |  | the needs and degree of satisfaction of students |  | + |  |  |
| 48 |  | the correspondence of the educational environment support the objectives of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
| 49 |  | Management should ensure that the structure and content of the MEP are reviewed, taking into account changes in the labor market, employers ' requirements and social needs of society, the degree of satisfaction of students |  | + |  |  |
| 50 |  | Management should provide evidence of the participation of students, employers and other stakeholders in the revision of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
| 51 |  | The MEP should ensure that all stakeholders are informed of any planned or taken actions, including publishing changes made to the MEP |  |  | + |  |
| **Total for standard** | 0 | 10 | 1 | 0 |
| **Standard 5. Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment of academic** |  |  |  |  |
| performance 52 |  | The MEP leadership should ensure respect and attention to different groups of students and their needs, providing them with flexible learning paths |  | + |  |  |
| 53 |  | The leadership should ensure that teaching is based on modern achievements of world science and practice in the field of training direction, using various modern teaching methods and evaluating learning outcomes that ensure the achievement of MEP |  | + |  |  |
| 54 |  | Management should determine the mechanisms for distributing students ' learning load between theory and practice, ensuring that each graduate learns the content and achieves the goals of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
| 55 |  | An important factor is the availability of their own research in the field of teaching MEP disciplines |  | + |  |  |
| 56 |  | The PA should ensure that the procedures for evaluating learning outcomes correspond to the planned results and goals of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
| 57 |  | The PA should ensure consistency, transparency and objectivity in the application of the learning achievement assessment mechanism |  | + |  |  |
| 58 |  | Evaluators should be familiar with modern methods of evaluating learning outcomes and regularly improve their skills in this area |  | + |  |  |
| 59 |  | The MEP management should demonstrate a feedback system for using various teaching methods and evaluating learning outcomes |  | + |  |  |
| 60 |  | The MEP management should demonstrate support for students ' autonomy, while providing guidance and assistance from external experts. teacher's side |  | + |  |  |
| 61 |  | The MEP management must demonstrate that there is a procedure in place to respond to student complaints |  | + |  |  |
| **Total according to standard** | 0 | 10 | 0 | 0 |
| **Standard 6. Students** |  |  |  |  |
| 62 |  | The PA should demonstrate the implementation of the student pooling policy and ensure transparency of its procedures |  | + |  |  |
| 63 |  | The PA management should demonstrate the implementation of special adaptation and support programs for first-year students, foreign students and mobility students  |  | + |  |  |
| 64 |  | The PA should demonstrate that its actions comply with the Lisbon Convention on recognition, including the use of a mechanism to recognize the results of academic mobility of students, as well as the results of formal and non-formal education |  | + |  |  |
| 65 |  | The NGO should cooperate with other educational organizations and national centers of the "European Network of National Information Centers for Academic Recognition and Mobility / National Academic Recognition Information Centers" ENIC / NARIC in order to ensure comparable recognition qualifications |  | + |  |  |
| 66 |  | The PA should provide an opportunity for external and internal mobility of MEP students, assist in obtaining external grants for training |  | + |  |  |
| 67 |  |  The educational organization should encourage students to self-educate and develop outside of the main program (extracurricular activities)  | + |  |  |  |
| 68 |  | An important factor is the availability of a support mechanism for gifted students | + |  |  |  |
| 69 |  | The educational organization should provide students with places of practice, demonstrate the procedure for promoting employment of graduates, maintaining communication with them | + |  |  |  |
| 70 |  |  Руководство MEP management should demonstrate that graduates of the program have skills that are in demand in the labor market | + |  |  |  |
| 71 |  | The MEP management should demonstrate the use of a mechanism for monitoring the employment and professional activities of graduates |  |  |  |  |
| 72 |  | An important factor is the presence of a functioning alumni association / association |  |  | + |  |
| **Total according to the standard** | 3 | 7 | 1 | 0 |
| **Standard 7. Teaching staff** |  |  |  |  |
| 73 |  | PA demonstrates implementation of an objective and transparent personnel policy to ensure the quality |  | of the MEP+ |  |  |
| 74 |  | PA management must demonstrate implementation of a personnel policy that includes hiring, professional growth and development of personnel that ensure the professional competence of the entire staff |  | + |  |  |
| 75 |  |  PA must demonstrate compliance with the quality of teaching staff qualifications, institutional strategy, and MEP goals | + |  |  |  |
| 76 |  | MEP management should demonstrate adequate funding for the development of teaching |  | staff+ |  |  |
| 77 |  | MEP management should demonstrate an awareness of responsibility for its employees, including young teachers, and provide them with favorable working conditions, career growth opportunities, and professional development |  | + |  |  |
| 78 |  | MEP management should demonstrate broad application of the following principles: Teaching staff of information and communication technologies and software tools in the educational process (for example, on-line training, e-portfolio, MOHSs, etc.) |  | + |  |  |
| 79 |  | The PA should demonstrate the focus on developing academic mobility, attracting the best foreign and domestic teachers |  | + |  |  |
| 80 |  | The PA should attract specialists from relevant sectors of the economy with professional competencies that meet the requirements of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
| 81 |  | The PA should determine the contribution of the MEP teaching staff to the implementation of the country's institutional development strategy, science and technology | + |  |  |  |
| 82 |  | The Management should demonstrate involvement of each teacher, including invited ones, in promoting a culture of quality and academic integrity in public education, and in achieving the goals of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
| **Total for standard** | 2 | 8 | 0 | 0 |
| **Standard 8. Educational resources and student support systems** |  |  |  |  |
| 83 | 1. | The educational organization must ensure that educational resources, including the material and technical base, and infrastructure meet the goals of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | *The educational organization must demonstrate that information resources meet the needs of the MEP, including in the following areas:* |  |  |  |  |
| 84 | 2. | technological support for students and teaching staff (for example, on-linetraining, modeling, databases, data analysis programs) |  | + |  |  |
| 85 | 3. | library resources, including a fund of educational, methodological and scientific literature on general education, basic and profile disciplines on paper and electronic media, periodicals, access to access to scientific databases |  | + |  |  |
| 86 | 4. | examination of research results, graduation papers, and dissertations for plagiarism |  | + |  |  |
| 87 | 5. | access to educational Internet resources |  | + |  |  |
| 88 | 6. | functioning of Wi-Fi on the territory of the public organization |  | + |  |  |
| 89 | 7. | The educational organization must demonstrate the availability of conditions for conducting research, publishing research results of teaching staff, employees and students, and integrating science and education |  | + |  |  |
| 90 | 8. | The educational organization should demonstrate the practical implementation of measures to provide the educational organization with educational equipment, software, and analogs used in the relevant sectors of the economy |  | + |  |  |
| 91 | 9. |  MEP management should demonstrate that there are procedures in place to support various groups of students, including informing and advising |  | + |  |  |
| 92 | 10. | The MEP guidelines should show that there are conditions for the student's progress along the individual educational path |  | + |  |  |
| 93 | 11. | The educational organization must demonstrate that the infrastructure meets the security requirements |  | + |  |  |
| **Total for standard** | 0 | 11 | 0 | 0 |
| **Standard 9. Public awareness** |  |  |  |  |
| 94 | 1. | The educational organization must demonstrate that the web resource reflects reliable, objective, up-to-date information that reflects all areas of activity within the framework of the MEP |  | + |  |  |
| 95 | 2. | Public awareness should include support and clarification of national development programs and the system of higher professional education |  | + |  |  |
| 96 | 3. | The educational organization should use a variety of ways of informing the general public and interested persons (including mass media, web resources, information networks, etc.) |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | *Management should ensure that information is provided based on the following MEP indicators:* |  |  |  |  |
| 97 | 4. | Purpose and planned results of MEP, qualification awarded in accordance with the NSC, QF-EHEA |  | + |  |  |
| 98 | 5. | information about the student achievement assessment system |  | + |  |  |
| 99 | 6. | information about academic mobility programs and other forms of cooperation with partner universities and employers |  | + |  |  |
| 100 | 7. | information on opportunities for developing students ' personal and professional competencies and employment |  | + |  |  |
| 101 | 8. | data reflecting the positioning of PLOS in the educational services market (at the regional, national and international levels) |  | + |  |  |
| 102 | 9. | The PA should ensure that the audited financial statements are published in the context of the PA on its own web resource |  | + |  |  |
| 103 | 10. | An important factor isthe publication on open resources of reliable information about teaching staff, in the context of personnel |  | + |  |  |
| 104 | 11. | An important factor is the publication of information on cooperation and interaction with partners, including scientific / consulting organizations, business and social partners, and other educational organizations |  | + |  |  |
| 105 | 12. | The educational organization should ensure that information and links to resources based on the results of external evaluation are published |  | + |  |  |
| **Standard total** | 0 | 12 | 0 | 0 |
| **TOTAL** | **7** | **94** | **4** | **0** |

7 (6.7%) parameter has the "strong"position

94 (89.5%) parameters have the "satisfactory"position

4 (3.8%) parameters have the position "suggests improvement"

0 (0 %) of the parameter has the"unsatisfactory" position